Putin's War, A European tragedy

The strategic impact of Air Denial

&

ACdre. Prof. Dr. Frans Osinga



Air raid alert all over Ukraine.

Threats of a massive Russian rocket attack.

All in Ukraine advised to stay in shelters.

#RussialsATerroristState

7:56 A



Russia 'fired over 50 missiles at Ukraine today'

Russia launched more than 50 missiles at Ukraine today, prime minister **Denys Shmyhal** has said, adding that most of those missiles were shot down.

Posting to Telegram, the Ukrainian PM said:

Russia cannot accept failures and therefore continues to terrorise the (Ukrainian) population. Another attempt (on Friday) to destroy the Ukrainian energy system and deprive Ukrainians of light, heat, and water.

Meanwhile, Ukraine's air force has said it shot down 61 of 71 Russian cruise missiles today. It said Russia had used eight Tu-95MS strategic bombers, and that they had fired X-101 and X-555 missiles from the Caspian Sea and the city of Volgodonsk in Russia.

A Telegram update from the air force said:

Visit to London an 'important step' on road to fighter jets





Михайло Подоляк 🤣 @Podolyak_M · Follow

RF has been striking at — cities all night & morning. RF's intention is the same: mass destruction & killing. Enough talk & political hesitation. Only fast key decisions: long-range missiles, fighter jets, operational supplies logistics for —. Or else genocide can't be stopped.

10:12 AM · Feb 10, 2023

Opening shots: the strategic impact of Air Denial

ØRUSI

for Defence and Security Studies

The Russian Air War and Ukrainian Requirements for Air Defence



"From early March, the VKS lost the ability to operate in Ukrainian-controlled airspace except at very low altitudes due to its inability to reliably suppress or destroy increasingly effective, well-dispersed and mobile Ukrainian surface-to-air missile (SAM) systems."

"It is purely thanks to its failure to destroy Ukraine's mobile SAM systems that Russia remains unable to effectively employ the potentially heavy and efficient aerial firepower of its fixedwing bomber and multi-role fighter fleets to bombard Ukrainian strategic targets and frontline positions from medium altitude, as it did in Syria."



Russia's missile deployment in Kaliningrad ups the stakes for Nato

Jonathan Marcus Diplomatic correspondent

Military Capabilities

NATO, US warns

9 October 2016

Russian Anti-Access and Area Denial (A2AD) Range: August 2016 S-400 deployments Confirmed range: 250km Unconfirmed range: 400km 12 AUG S-400 deployment to Crimea S-300 deployments Range:150-200km non-NATO NATO Russia Helsin Stockho Moscow Kaliningrad Chisinău AFA 2015: Russia has closed air power gap with Madric Yerevan • Ankara Marina Malenic, Washington, DC - IHS Jane's Latakia, Svria Defence Weekly, 16 September 2015

The challenges of A2AD: credible NATO deterrence posture?

- insufficient in-place ground forces: just tripwire
- Shortage of deep strike, SEAD, ISR, EW assets
- Air & missile defence scarce
- Lack of air superiority 4th Gen Fgts vis a vis Ru SAMs
- air support to ground problematic
- Questionable credibility of conventional deterrence & collective defence
- Default posture: Deterrence by punishment
- Vulnerable for Ru limited probe

Survival	Survival Global Politics and Strategy
ing it dans to be branches on	ISSN: 0039-6338 (Print) 1468-2699 (Online) Journal homepage: http://www.tandfonline.com/fol/tsur20
	cing Russia: Conventional Defence and eterrence in Europe
Elb	ridge Colby & Jonathan Solomon
Survival ==-	1
Sovereignty and disorder	Survival
Mary .	Global Politics and Strategy
	ISSN: 0039-6338 (Print) 1468-2699 (Online) Journal homepage: <u>http://www.tandfonline.com/foi/tsur2</u>
N	ATO, A2/AD and the Kaliningrad Challenge
Ste	phan Frühling & Guillaume Lasconjarias
Survival	Survival
Defeating ISIS	Global Politics and Strategy
Some Ser	

An Area-Access Strategy for NATO

Fabrice Pothier

To cite this article: Fabrice Pothier (2017) An Area-Access Strategy for NATO, Survival, 59:3, 73-80, DOI: <u>10.1080/00396338.2017.1325600</u>

iSN: 0039-6338 (Print) 1468-2699 (Online) Journal homepage: http://www.tandfonline.com/loi/tsur2

To link to this article: http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/00396338.2017.1325600

Ukr also got lucky; Ru Failed Initial Campaign

- 10 day Blitzkrieg stype campaign, no long term plans
- Flawed assumptions
 - Low troops density, 4 fronts
 - Units not prepared for intense combat ops
- Only short SA & OCA campaign
- Poor Joint Warfare Skills
 - RU uncoordinated infantry-armor ops results in many losses
 - RU uncoordinated airmobile ops into defended airfields
 - RU fails to gain air superiority
 - lack of air-land coordination
 - Mounting losses: 88 a/c & heli, 2000 casualties week 1

Why the first few days of war in Ukraine went badly for Russia

Russia banked on Kyiv falling quickly. Here's why it hasn't. By Zack Beauchamp | @zackbeauchamp | zack@vox.com | Feb 28, 2022, 6:50pm EST Battle for Kyiv: Ukrainian valor, Russian blunders combined to save the capital







Russia's failed air war Feb-April

- OCA & DCA day 1-3
 - EW, Air Strikes, CM & BMs against Early Warning rdrs, fixed AD sites
 - limited OCA & SEAD ops after day 3, shift to ground support
 - Effective use of Ru CAPs with long range missiles, outclass old Ukr fighters
- Ukrainian Air Defence After day 1-3:
 - dispersal, air denial, combi GBAD & fighters
 - Jamming of Ru SAMs & comms
 - After March: increasing attrition on Ru fighters
 - Air denial effective: offers freedom of maneuver for Ukr army







Russia's failed air war Feb-April

- Low effectiveness Ru air strikes
 - Single sorties/pairs
 - Low PGM stocks, use unguided ammo from med altitude
 - Target intel issues & Poor target acquisition & aiming tech
- CAS
 - lack of training
 - Air-land Comms & coordination problems
 - Risky Lo lvl tactics limit strike effectiveness
- Increasing # city bombing sorties
- Low sortie rates: initially 140, later 250-300/day







Mar-Jun: Air Denial against Infra attacks

• Limited impact,

- late in war
- Low Ru stockpiles: intensity & frequency limited
- Alternatives offer only limited accuracy
- Ukrainian AD increasingly effective
 - redeployed for AD against CMs around key cities/infra
 - March-April: interception rates 20–30%, mid-June 50–60%.
 - SA-11 'Buk' SAM systems allocated to frontline defence
 - long-range S-300 SAMs for city & infra defence
 - more capable against CMs & Tochka-U BMs
 - coverage over a wider area/less mobile than SA-11

Missiles hit power stations in Lviv and along crucial railways in central and western Ukraine.

Altogether, six electrical substations were struck along the railways in central and western Ukraine, according to a top rail official. The rail system is the country's lifeline for humanitarian and military supplies.

Russia intensifies attacks on railways, taking aim at Ukraine's lifeline to the outside world



NATIONAL SECURITY

Russia tries to rebound in Ukraine as prospects for victory fade

Fight for air superiority

- More use of RU fighters & EW in SEAD role
- Forcing Ukr AD to switch on
- Strikers come in low in DEAD role
- Art'y against SAMs
- Ukr SAMs forced further from front
- Increasing *#* of Ru CAS, AI, but < 100km from front
- Ukr manpads result in lo effectiveness CAS
- Long range bombers with CMs
- High level Ru stand-off CAPs with long range AD msls



Man by George Borros, Katerina Stepanenko und Thomas Bergeran

NATIONAL SECURITY

U.S. dials up shipments of radar-hunting missiles for Ukraine

By Dan Lamothe September 8, 2022 at 3:53 p.m. EDT

Ukrainian Su-27s Are Now Using AGM-88 **HARM Missiles Too**



STEFANO D'URSO



An Ukrainian Su-27 loaded with two AGM-88 HARM missiles. (Photo via Telegram)

The Ukrainian Air Force posted a video that appears to show a Ukrainian MiG-29 fighter armed with an AGM-88 HARM missile. facebook.com/kpszsu/videos/...



KHERSON AXIS UKRAINE REPORTS THE DESTRUCTION OF TWO RUSSSIAN 1245 UTC 8 SEPT S-400 AIR DEFENSE COMPLEXES, MI-24 AND Ka-52s.



TOPO MAP COURTESY @COMMCEN76 @ INDICATIONS & WARNINGS / @CHUCK PFARRER MMXXII





- Novel combinations with infantry & art'y ops
- Used in counter AD in EW mode combined with strike fighters
- High attrition number: 90%
- Average sortie # before KIA: 5-6
- Vulnerable for EW
- Radiolocation: Risks for operators

Drones over Ukraine: Death in different sizes

Iranian Shahed-136 drones can loiter over areas for hours until their cameras identify a target and the drone drops on it like a bomb. The Russians are using these weapons to devastating effect without risk to their troops.



For Ukraine, Keeping the Lights On Is One of the Biggest Battles

This week's missile assault by Russian forces has hit at least 15 energy facilities — some for the fifth or sixth time — forcing controlled blackouts in every part of the country.

Ukraine's high interception rate

Recent Russian missile attacks

FINANCIAL TIMES

💳 Number launched 💻 Number intercepted 💻 % intercepted 100 --10080 - 80 60 -- 60 40 - 40 20 --20Oct 10 Oct 11 Oct 22 Oct 31 Nov 15 Nov 17 Nov 23 Dec 5

STRIKES AT THE INFRASTRUCTURE OF THE ENERGY SYSTEM OF UKRAINE October 22, 2022 BELARUS @RYBAR RUSSIAN FEDERATION L'eles ka Teta (1) Kharkiv arkivs ka Tets - 5 Ð Zmilvska TPP Burshtyna ka Teo Ivano-Frankivsk I Ladyzhynn ka Te Cher AFU territorial control 330 kV substation 130 kV power ROMANI clarification required n October 22 Source: Ukrainian Air Force Command, General Staff of Ukrainian Armed Forces via Dragon Capital

"We have no other choice but to switch to these types of weapons since the Soviet weapons of the [19]70s and [19]80s are both [...] obsolete and the enemy is exhausting them every day."















140	IN EUROPE	INTIONAL BATTLE	FIELD FORCES				
Cat	The air denial	NATO ¹	Pact ²				
	challenge 🛛	ces					
Mai	vision E cents ³ in Battl ks cillery, tar, & Multiple	90 19,600	133 32,000				
Roc Ant	cket Launders i-tank Gus and Missile	14,200	23,000				
Ant	i-aircraft Guns and Missile	6,900	12,800				
Inf	antry Fighting Vehicles	32,850	38,000				
	Infantry Fighting Vehicles 32,850 38,000 <u>Aircraft</u> Armed Helicopters 1,430 1,410						
Lan	nd Attack Aircraft ⁴	2.360	3,200				
Fig	hter/Interceptors	900	2,7005				
Source: Adapted from Andrew Hamilton, "Redressing the Conventional Balance," International Security 10 (Summer 1985), 114; U.S. Department of Defense, Soviet Military Power 1987 (Washington, D.C.: GPO, 1987), pp. 92-93.							

NATO/WARSAW PACT CONVENTIONAL BATTLEFIELD FORCES

Table 1.





1967 MC 14/3 Flexible response

• New emphasis on conventional forces

Air strategy tasks:

- 1. Secure initial deployments from air attacks
- 2. Protect ports
- 3. Preserve freedom of maneuver for ground forces:



Das Luftverteidigungssystem der NATO



FOFA concept

- Deep strikes Tornado, F-111
- COMAO packages: Recce, AI & OCA
- Embedded SEAD/DEAD/EW/SWEEP
- BAI, CAS
- MLRS
- JSTARS & AWACS
- Corps/Div Air Liasons

Table 6-1: Summary of Targets and Objectives for FOFA*

		Range (kilometers beyo	eters beyond FLOT)	
argets	5 to 30	30 to 80	80 to 150	150 to 350	350 to 800
Moving columns	1	1	2		
Inits in assembly areas	1	1	2		
Command posts		2	2		
Chokepoints and halted units			2	2	
Inits transported on roads				2	
Inits in off-loading areas				2	
Inits transported on rails					3
Rail network					3
Levels of damage	1 "Destroy"				
	2 "Disrupt"				
	3 "Delay"				
This choice of objectives for FOFA operations is based on 1 nfo	rmation received from	SHAPE, USArm	y, and US Air Force :	sources, as discussed	i n ch 5This choic

aThis choice of objectives for FOFA operations is based on information received from SHAPE, USAITHY, and USAIT Force sources, as discussed in ch DTH of tarbets and objectives is for OTA analysis only, and us not intended to be exhaustive or definitive Deserve to for discussion of desired levels of damage

SOURCE Office of Technology Assessment, 1987



PROCEDURAL CONTROL

Relies on previously agreed to and distributed airspace control measures such as:

- Comprehensive air defense identification procedures and rules of engagement
- Low level transit routes
- Minimum risk routes
- Aircraft identification maneuvers
- Fire support coordinating measures.
- Coordinating altitudes
- Restricted operations zone/ restrictive fire area
- Standard use Army aircraft flight route
- High-density airspace control zone

<text><section-header><text><text><text><text>

Atlantic Council

Air & MSL Def critical for deterrence credibility

- invest in conventional **deterrence by denial** capabilities to close the tactical-nuclear gap and to prevent the renuclearization of European security
- address critical capability shortfalls in A2/AD
 - stand-off munitions,
 - counter A2/AD: SEAD, DEAD,
 - Enhanced GBAD, TBMD, counter drone
 - EW
 - Modernized (& hardened) C4ISR.
 - 5th Generation combat aircraft
- Exploit Western asymmetric edge to avoid attritional confrontation: sea & air power